Can we achieve a coherent policy approach to ESD?

What might a coherent policy approach look like?

Dr Alan Britton
Director, Education for Global Citizenship Unit
Internationalisation Lead
School of Education
University of Glasgow

alan.britton@glasgow.ac.uk
Aims of this presentation

To consider:

• Whether there is something distinctive about the Scottish approach to ESD;
• Whether it is especially coherent;
• Whether there are barriers to coherence; locally, regionally and nationally.

To provoke:

• Does ‘policy coherence’ always work?
• What other variables have to be considered?
• Can other nations and the Network learn from the Scottish experience?

Three case studies: local, regional, transnational
Why does policy coherence matter?

http://www.triplepundit.com/
Coherence among international agendas and processes
MDGs; Rio+20 SDGs; Climate Change Agenda, G20

Coherence between economic; social and environmental policies
For more integrated approaches to sustainability

Coherence between global goals and national contexts
Universal Agenda

Coherence between different sources of finance
Public, private, international and domestic

Coherence between diverse actions of multiple actors and stakeholders
Governments, international and regional organisations, CSOs; private sector
Why does policy coherence matter?
ESD in Scotland: policy coherence in action?

- Global (e.g. UNESCO)
- Regional (EU)
- National (UK) & (Scotland)
- Local/municipal
- Schools

www.learningteacher.eu
ESD Policy Coherence in Scotland

4 Dimensions of ESD:
- Learning content
- Pedagogy and Learning environments
- Learning outcomes
- Societal transformation
  (GAP Roadmap, p12)
CASE STUDIES: COHERENCE AT LOCAL, REGIONAL AND TRANSNATIONAL LEVELS?
Policy Coherence at a local level: Case Study One

Before the developments...

Images courtesy of Rachel Allen
Local coherence: parental involvement, community engagement; pupil participation; recycling.

Parent helpers

Recycled materials
Local coherence: Health and wellbeing; science education; outdoor learning.

Planting an orchard

An outdoor classroom

Images courtesy of Rachel Allen
Local coherence: community engagement; food miles and food preparation; recycling.

Recycling with the community

Growing food on site
Regional policy coherence: Case Study 2

The Crofting Connections project objectives:

- Increase children’s and young people’s understanding of the connections between crofting, food, health and the environment;
- Support schools and communities to create local food-growing initiatives;
- Promote crofting to young people and encourage new entrants;
- Safeguard crofting heritage and traditions unique to local communities;
- Encourage communities to reduce their ecological and carbon footprints;
- Increase public knowledge and appreciation of crofting;
- Provide high quality volunteering opportunities.
Regional policy coherence: Case Study 2

“…compelling evidence that Crofting Connections contributed greatly to a range of policy initiatives including Curriculum for Excellence (CfE), Learning for Sustainability; Recipe for Success and the subsequent consultation Becoming a Good Food Nation and the report on the Commission for Developing Scotland’s Young Workforce.”

The project also impacted positively on aspects of culture, community regeneration, inter-generational education, and community sustainability.


Images ©Crofting Connections
Transnational Policy Coherence: Case Study 3

- EuropeAid funded.
- Partner organisations from Belgium, Cyprus, France, Italy, Portugal, Scotland, and Spain.
- Main goal is to create a common European framework on food waste reduction and to promote learning and actions around global food security.

www.learningteacher.eu
Transnational Policy Coherence: Case Study 3

- Young people in schools work with their peers and with local authorities;
- Ambition is to create *coherent* and consistent policy approaches and solutions to food waste at ‘municipality’ level and at EU level;
- Connections established between food waste policy and issues of global food security and sustainable development;
- Young participants are learning about the need for policy coherence (and the reality of frequent incoherence!)
Policy coherence explored: the Global Right to Food

Twenty-two countries have enshrined the right to food in their constitutions, either for all citizens or specifically for children. Unfortunately, no country has yet instituted specific legislative measures to implement this right. Laws will need to address common areas such as land tenure, access to water, minimum wage levels, social safety nets, credit, rural markets, food production and food quality.
Policy coherence explored: Food aesthetic requirements in the EU

- **Apples**: At least 90 gr
- **Lemons**: At least 45 mm
- **Nectarines**: Elongated deviations max 2 cm², Other deviations max 1.5 cm²
- **Lettuce**: At least 150 gr
Creating a Charter for Young People and Local Authorities
(Milan Expo, October 2015)
Extracts from the Charter

- Only by a systemic approach, that involves all social and institutional actors, can these global challenges and problems be addressed to ensure the sustainability of our future.
- Avoid choosing food for its appearance (especially fruit and vegetables). Encourage consumers, producers and retailers to rethink the aesthetic norms for food, so that it doesn’t have to be uniform in appearance;
- Promote a preference for seasonal, locally grown and organic food (especially fruit and vegetables), in light of the health benefits and more sustainable origins of such produce;
- Inform the public about food waste by using all forms of communication, particularly social media to share direct and engaging ways to reduce food waste;

(Further details on the Project available from the presenter)
Policy coherence, ‘soft’ and ‘hard’ changes

**Soft change**
- Self-regulation
- Hearts and minds
- Non prescriptive
- Subsidiarity
- Bottom up
- Next generation
- Autonomy

**Hard change**
- Legislation
- Set curricula
- Targets
- Centralised
- Top down
- This generation
- Accountability
An example of ‘Hard’ change: the introduction of plastic bag charges in Scotland

- Before the charge was introduced, Scotland consumed around 800 million carrier bags every year (approx. 160 per capita).
- 5p (around 7 centimes) charge introduced last year for every plastic bag issued.
- Interim data shows a reduction of around 80 per cent in use, with funds of around £6.7m being donated to good causes as a result of the charge.
- Net carbon saving of the charge is equivalent to more than 2,500 tonnes of CO2 every year.

https://www.holyrood.com/articles/comment/how-plastic-bag-charge-changed-scotland
The Scottish aspiration for the UN Decade on ESD

“Our aim is that by 2014 people in Scotland will have developed the knowledge, understanding, skills and values to live more sustainable lives.”

(Scottish Government, 2006)
Renewable Energy Use (OECD, 2012)

Greater use of renewable energy sources will help reduce air pollution and greenhouse gas emissions. Use of renewables is growing but still accounted for only about 8.5% of energy generation in OECD countries in 2012.
ESD Policy coherence in Scotland?

- Distinctive Scottish (i.e. non-UK) commitments and targets in relation to Sustainable Development.
- UN Decade was reasonably prominent in Scottish education.
- Progress reports issued, and final review published, focusing on case studies of good practice;
- Learning for Sustainability Report 2012: ‘entitlement’ to LfS;
- Sustainability enshrined in teachers’ professional standards;
- RCE/LfSS provides focal point for activity.
Limits to ESD coherence; the wider picture

- Minority of teachers directly engaged;
- Imbalance of sector engagement (primary and secondary schools);
- Curriculum entitlement still not mainstreamed;
- Limited coherence, e.g. food policy and food culture, waste management, etc.
- Variable engagement in Teacher Education sectors.
- Variable engagement at local government level.
- Need for continued vigilance, commitment to ESD/LfS, and further educational measures.
A challenge for the LTN...

PRIORITY ACTION AREA 3

“Building capacities of educators and trainers: Increase the capacities of educators and trainers to more effectively deliver ESD”

Key question:

What elements of policy coherence at local, regional, national and transnational levels will be required to contribute to this?